

NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

SCRUTINY OF HEALTH COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held at Belle Vue Offices, Skipton on 23 September 2011, commencing at 10.00 am.

PRESENT:-

County Councillor Jim Clark (Chairman).

County Councillors:-Val Arnold, John Clark, Polly English, Andrew Goss, Herbert Tindall (substitute for Mike Knaggs), Margaret Hulme, Shelagh Marshall, Heather Moorhouse and Michael Hesletine (substitute for Chris Pearson).

District Council Members: - Helen Firth (Craven), Michael Dyson (Selby) and Jim Preston (Scarborough).

Officers: Bryon Hunter (Scrutiny Team Leader), Jane Wilkinson (Legal and Democratic Services).

Present by Invitation:

Yorkshire Ambulance Service – Vince Larvin.

Airedale NHS Foundation Trust – Bridget Fletcher.

Bradford District NHS Care Trust – Paul Hogg.

Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf of County Councillors John Blackie Mike Knaggs, John McCartney and Chris Pearson and District Councillors Kay McSherry (Selby) and John Raper (Ryedale).

In attendance seven members of the press and public.

COPIES OF ALL DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED ARE IN THE MINUTE BOOK

88. MINUTES

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 17 June 2011 to be taken as read and be confirmed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

89. CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Information relating to the following matters was tabled at the meeting and a copy placed in the minute book.

- **Operating Theatres at Whitby & Malton Community Hospitals.**
- **Children's Cardiac Surgery.**
- **Scarborough Pain Clinic.**
- **Community Services in South Tees Hospitals Foundation Trust.**
- **UK Councils Against Fluoridation.**
- **Changes To Home Oxygen Services.**
- **Non Emergency Patient Transfer Services.**
- **Response from NHS North Yorkshire & York to Questions Raised by Whitby Hospital Action Group.**

The Committee noted that a meeting to discuss Scarborough Pain Clinic had been cancelled and was in the process of being rearranged.

Now responsible for community services South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust planned to conduct a major 'bed utilisation' exercise. Full details to be relayed to Members in due course.

90. PUBLIC QUESTIONS OR STATEMENTS

On behalf of Whitby Hospital Action Group, Sarah Wyatt addressed the meeting to express strong concern about:-

- Comments made by Mike Proctor, Interim Chief Executive Scarborough & North East Yorkshire NHS Trust that Whitby Community Hospital was not "fit for purpose". His comments were featured in an article in the Whitby Gazette that day on future service provision and the possible re-location of Whitby Community Hospital.
- The continued closure and lack of investment in the operating theatres at Whitby Community Hospital.

Sarah Wyatt complained about a lack of public consultation. She said that decisions were being made on financial grounds which placed the health-care needs of the local population at significant risk.

The Chairman agreed to include an item on Whitby Community Hospital on the agenda of the next meeting and to invite Jayne Brown Chief Executive, NHS North Yorkshire & York and Mike Proctor and Patrick Crowley (Scarborough & North East Yorkshire NHS Trust) to attend.

91. RESPONSE TO THE CONSULTATION BY YORKSHIRE AMBULANCE SERVICE ON PROPOSALS FOR OPERATING AS AN NHS FOUNDATION TRUST

The Committee received a power-point presentation from Vince Larvin, Assistant Director Operations, Yorkshire Ambulance Service on their application to become a foundation trust in 2012. A copy of the slides used is in the Minute Book. The Committee was advised that the application was the subject of public consultation, the closing date for responses being 12 December 2011.

Future plans and priorities designed to enhance the Service were outlined to Members together with the proposed constitution of the new organisation. Members were invited to respond and to encourage others to submit a response to the consultation.

Further details on telehealth and use of the 111 number for calls less urgent than 999 calls were provided in response to questions from Members.

Members queried the disparity in the number of seats allocated to elected governors from North Yorkshire as compared to West Yorkshire and asked if the number could be increased. The Committee was advised that the proposed allocation of seats was based on the volume of patient calls received in each geographical area. The Chairman suggested that distance as well as volume should be a determining factor. Vince Larvin invited the Committee to make this point in their response to the consultation. In response to further questions about how the total number of elected governors had been determined and divided between each of the three nominated groups that comprised the Council of Governors he agreed to provide further information following the meeting.

The Chairman asked why two of the proposed appointed governor seats had been allocated to primary care trusts which would shortly cease to exist and how Clinical Commissioning Groups were to be represented. He also sought clarification of the selection process for the appointment of elected governors from the dozen or so local authorities eligible to make nominations. Vince Larvin said that the decision to appoint two primary care trust governors was because they were the lead commissioners of the Service. He acknowledged that the position regarding GP representation had still to be determined. With regard to the election process of local authority governors he said he did not know and that he would consult with the Executive Team on his return and thereafter provide the Committee with an answer.

A Member representing a rural area said it would be difficult to convince the local population that transition to foundation status would result in an improved service when response times were not as good as they had been in the past.

Vince Larvin disputed this and said that performance in rural areas had over the last year improved as was demonstrated by response time statistics. The rationalisation of call-centres had led to the creation of a specialist rural team responsible for rural dispatches. The current financial year had seen changes introduced to staff rostering which had brought about further improvements. He acknowledged that some issues remained with regard to non-emergency services/patient transfer service. Members suggested that performance information was made available to parish councils.

In response to questions about first-responders the Committee noted a recruitment campaign was currently underway. Members asked to be supplied with a list of current participants.

A member referred to cross-boundary issues and said that greater cooperation/communication was still needed.

In summing up the Chairman thanked Vince Larvin for his attendance and the information he had provided. Members were invited to respond individually to the consultation and/or submit any additional comments they had to the Scrutiny Team Leader by no later than 14 October 2011. A response on behalf of the Committee would then be drafted based on the comments made during the meeting and those received from Members and referred to the next meeting.

RESOLVED –

That the draft response of the Committee to the consultation on the application by Yorkshire Ambulance Trust for foundation trust status be referred to the next meeting.

The Scrutiny of Health Committee recommends that Yorkshire Ambulance Service circulates to all parish councils in North Yorkshire a copy of the consultation documents.

92. SERVICES AT AIREDALE HOSPITAL

Bridget Fletcher, Chief Executive of Airedale NHS Foundation Trust gave a presentation to the Committee on Airedale Hospital. Topics covered by the presentation included, performance and achievements, service developments, innovation and future objectives. The Committee heard how the Trust continued to be acknowledged as a high performing Trust and how particularly since taking over community services it was developing new ways of delivering healthcare locally. Telehealth was an integral part of that work and the Trust was happy to work with the Committee to expand this service. A copy of the presentation slides is in the Minute

Book. The purpose of the presentation was to provide a snap shot of Airedale Hospital and to raise awareness within the Scrutiny Committee.

Bridget Fletcher said that legislative changes coupled with advances in technology and medicine meant that the traditional hospital dominated service delivery model was about to undergo a period of radical change. Future services would she said be the hub for a joined up approach that linked community, primary, local authority and the voluntary sector.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Bridget Fletcher responded to a number of requests from Members for further information on services and aspects of performance monitoring. County Councillor Shelagh Marshall said that she received frequent complaints about hospital appointments especially from elderly patients living in remote areas. Bridget Fletcher acknowledged that this was an area where improvements were needed. The present system was she said based on lots of separate clinics being held at the Hospital which she agreed was confusing. Bridget Fletcher said that she would be happy to work with the Committee or individual Councillors to find a solution.

The Committee noted that initially the outsourcing of hospital catering had attracted complaints but that the situation was now much improved.

Members were impressed by the overall performance of the hospital and its innovative approach to redesigning services.

The Chairman thanked Bridget Fletcher for an excellent presentation.

RESOLVED –

That the presentation and information provided at the meeting be noted.

93. RESPONSE TO THE CONSULTATION BY BRADFORD DISTRICT CARE TRUST ON PROPOSALS FOR OPERATING AS AN NHS FOUNDATION TRUST

The Committee received a presentation from Paul Hogg, Trust Secretary at Bradford District Care Trust on its application to become a NHS Foundation Trust in 2013. A copy of the presentation slides used is in the Minute Book.

The Committee was advised that the application was the subject of public consultation, the closing date for responses being 5 December 2011.

Paul Hogg guided the Committee through the consultation document attached to the agenda. Members noted that the Trust's AGM was due to take place on 29 September 2011 at 4.00 pm in Victoria Hall, Keighley.

Paul Hogg highlighted changes made to original recommendations regarding the appointment of Governors. Previously City of Bradford Metropolitan had been allocated three seats; this had now been reduced to just one. Also the appointment of a North Yorkshire County Council governor had been replaced with the appointment of a governor from Craven District Council.

Members commented that the proposal to have six appointed governors, only one of whom was from Craven was inequitable. Issues concerning rurality and travelling times were unique to patients from Craven area and should they said be given greater recognition. The Committee was advised that the allocation of seats proposed was based on the population in each local authority area. Paul Hogg invited the Committee to make this point in their response to the consultation.

Members were pleased to note that the role of older people had been recognised and suggested that the appointment of a governor representing Age UK or the Alzheimer's Society on the Council of Governors would be appropriate. Paul Hogg agreed to report this suggestion back.

Members highlighted IT problems encountered by staff not being able to access patient records. Paul Hogg replied that the transfer of community services staff to the Trust on 1 April had included their existing IT systems that were not compatible with those used by the Trust. Work was ongoing to resolve this problem.

County Councillor Polly English said she was aware that the Trust had experienced bed shortages and was concerned that service issues would not be fully explored by application for foundation status which tended to focus more on governance and finance issues. Paul Hogg replied that previously this was the case but that since the Mid Staffs hospital scandal the Government was keen for service quality to be at the heart of all applications for foundation status. Consequently Monitor had drawn up a compliance framework document that comprised of ten questions. The questions placed greater emphasis on service quality and completion of the compliance document was now a fundamental part of the application process. The Committee was advised that the Trust's Board would have to self-certify the answers to the questions posed in the framework document. Assurances were given that any issues would be addressed by the Board at its quarterly meetings.

In summing up the Chairman thanked Paul Hogg for his attendance and the information he had provided. Members were invited to respond individually to the consultation and/or submit any additional comments they had to the Scrutiny Team Leader by no later than 14 October 2011. A response on behalf of the Committee would then be drafted based on comments made during the meeting and those received from Members and be referred to the next meeting.

RESOLVED –

That the draft response of the Committee to the consultation on the application by Bradford District Care Trust for foundation trust status be referred to the next meeting.

94. INDEPENDENT REVIEW OF HEALTH SERVICES IN NORTH YORKSHIRE & YORK

CONSIDERED –

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader inviting the Committee to endorse a letter tabled at the meeting addressed to the Strategic Health Authority requesting further information on implementation of the review findings and how it envisages the Committee can be involved in that work.

The Chairman said that he had met with Bill McCarthy, Chief Executive NHS Yorkshire & Humber the previous evening who had welcomed the Committee's support and who was keen to progress the review during the interim period before the Health & Well Being Board became fully operational.

Members endorsed the content of the tabled letter.

The Chairman said that the Independent Review would be a major area of work for the Committee over the forthcoming months.

RESOLVED –

That the content of the letter tabled at the meeting be endorsed.

95. WORK PROGRAMME

CONSIDERED –

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Team Leader inviting Members to comment on and approve the content of the Committee's future work programme.

Members were advised that the November meeting date could be changed in order to accommodate attendance by representatives of South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust.

Members noted the delay in the consultation on Inpatient and Community People's Mental Health in Craven by Bradford District Care Trust. In response to a request from the Chairman, District Councillor Helen Firth (Craven) on behalf of the Craven scrutiny committee agreed lead work on drafting a response to the consultation.

Children's Cardiac Surgery – The Chairman reported that the Yorkshire & Humber Region Joint Scrutiny of Health Committee was calling for both Leeds and Newcastle to be retained. A further consultation on Adult Cardiac Surgery was about to be launched and it was the view of the Joint Committee that no decision should be taken on children's cardiac surgery until the proposals for adults were taken into account. The Chairman reported that the Joint Committee was highly critical of the way in which the consultation had been managed.

Quality Accounts – An approach to attend a future meeting of the Committee to discuss the integration of acute and community services had been made by Harrogate & District NHS Foundation Trust. The Chairman said he had suggested they attend early in the New Year.

Whitby Community Hospital – Report to be included on agenda of November meeting with invitations to attend sent Mike Proctor and Patrick Crowley (Scarborough & North East Yorkshire NHS Trust) as well as Jayne Brown (NHS North Yorkshire & York). Item to encompass the concerns expressed by Sarah Wyatt (Whitby Hospital Action Group) earlier in the meeting and the implications for the Hospital of the findings of the Independent Review carried out by Prof Hugo Mascie-Taylor.

Members referred to the appointment of Helen Taylor as the County Council's new Corporate Director Health & Adult Services and suggested that she be invited to attend the November meeting.

RESOLVED –

That the content of the Work Programme is approved subject to the comments recorded in the Minutes.

The meeting concluded at 12.30 pm.

JW/ALJ